

## **Investigating the Physics of Burning Thermonuclear Plasmas**

#### **Brian D. Appelbe**

Centre for Inertial Fusion Studies Imperial College London

bappelbe@ic.ac.uk





- Theoretical & computational research of ICF & HEDP physics
- Based at Imperial College London, jointly funded with AWE
- Directors Prof J Chittenden & Prof S Rose, ~10 researchers (RA & PhD)
- 3D Radiation-Hydrodynamic & Magnetohydrodynamic simulations (Chimera & Gorgon)
- Synthetic nuclear diagnostics for ICF
- Atomic & radiation physics
- Vlasov-Fokker-Planck Modelling



simulation

## **CIFS – Current Activities**

- 1. MHD modelling of MagNIF (S. O' Neill)
- 2. Extended-MHD modelling of MagLIF (A. Boxall)
- 3. AMR grid development (N. Chaturvedi)
- 4. 3D CBET modelling (P. Moloney)
- 5. Self-consistent EOS & opacity modelling (A. Fraser)







#### **CIFS – Current Activities**

-5000

10000

100 120 140

Distribution of  $v_{\parallel}$  component

Nuclear synthetic diagnostics (A. Crilly & B. Appelbe)

t=729.9107[ps]

2000

0 [*su/urt*]<sup>||</sup>/ -2000

-4000

20

40

60

 $r[\mu m]$ 

80



Primary neutron spectra in shock driven capsules

W. Taitano, B. Keenan (LANL) O. Mannion (LLE) M. Gatu Johnson (MIT)



#### **CIFS – Current Activities**



Secondary neutron spectra for magnetized ICF J. Moody, H. Sio (LLNL)



[4a] Schmit et al, PRL 113, 155004 (2014)

Nuclear synthetic diagnostics

(A. Crilly & B. Appelbe)



#### Contents

- 1. Overview of Burning Plasmas
- 2. The interaction of  $\alpha$  particles with electrons
  - Appelbe et al, *Physics of Plasmas* **26**, 102704 (2019)
- 3. Magnetic field transport in propagating thermonuclear burn
  - Appelbe et al, *Physics of Plasmas* **28**, 032705 (2021)
- 4. Conclusions



Physical quantities have extreme gradients in time & space

Imperial College London

 Significant energy exchange processes

[2] Tong et al, NF **59**, 086015 (2019)

#### [3] Rose et al, PTRSA 378, 20200014 (2020)



# **Microphysics of Burn**



Do we understand these processes with sufficient precision to ensure macroscopic models are accurate?

# **Microphysics of Burn - Challenges**

- High pr Compton scattering in lines and continuum
- High  $\rho$  continuum lowering
- High I(v) photoionisation / non-LTE with line transport, e+e- pair production, photonuclear processes, non-equilibrium f<sub>e</sub>(v), continuum lowering, double Compton scattering
- High T<sub>e</sub> non-LTE populations, relativistic corrections to rates, relativistic correction to e-i exchange
- High T<sub>i</sub> ion excitation rates
- High α flux non-equilibrium f<sub>e</sub>(v), f<sub>i</sub>(v), non-equilibrium e-i exchange, α-excitation rates, α-nuclear reactions
- High n flux non-equilibrium  $f_i(v)$ , n-nuclear reactions.
- Extreme gradients in space and time
- Magnetic Fields

Imperial College

London

# **B** fields & ignition



Magnetically-assisted ignition

Magneto-Inertial Fusion

Effects of *B* field:

- Reduce electron thermal conduction losses from hot fuel
- Magnetically confine  $\alpha$  particles (for very high *B* fields)

[4] Moody et al, POP **27**, 112711 (2020) [5] Gomez et al, PRL **125**, 155002 (2020)

Imperial College

London

#### **B** fields in ICF





**Biermann Battery** 

$$\frac{\partial \mathbf{B}}{\partial t} = \frac{1}{en} \nabla T \times \nabla n$$

[6] Walsh et al, PRL **118**, 155001 (2017)





- 1. Overview of Burning Plasmas
- 2. The interaction of  $\alpha$  particles with electrons
  - Appelbe et al, *Physics of Plasmas* **26**, 102704 (2019)
- 3. Magnetic field transport in propagating thermonuclear burn
  - Appelbe et al, *Physics of Plasmas* **28**, 032705 (2021)
- 4. Conclusions





#### A. L. Velikovich

Naval Research Laboratory

#### M. Sherlock, C. Walsh

Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory

#### O. El-Amiri

University of Warwick

S. O' Neill, A. Crilly, A. Boxall, J. P. Chittenden Imperial College London

## **Electron response to** $\alpha$ particles

- MD & PiC models show fast ions generate rich electron dynamics (e.g. wakes)
- Such effects usually not included in integrated simulations of ICF/MIF experiments since  $\tau_{ee}$  ,  $\tau_{ei}~\ll~\tau_{e\alpha}$
- Instead, stopping power model is used to conserve energy & momentum between fast ions and fluid
- Is this ok?

#### What about ions?

- For  $T_i$ ,  $T_e \sim 1 10 \text{ keV } \alpha$  particles lose most energy in e- $\alpha$  collisions
- Various ion kinetic studies have shown moderate perturbation of ions by  $\alpha$  particles

[10] Michta et al, POP 17, 012707 (2010)
[11] Sherlock et al, HEDP 5, pp.27-30 (2009)
[12] Peigney et al, POP 21, 122709 (2014)





## **The Electron VFP Equation**

• Weakly-coupled, non-degenerate plasmas

$$\frac{\partial f_e}{\partial t} + \mathbf{v} \cdot \nabla f_e - \frac{e}{m_e} \left( \mathbf{E} + \mathbf{v} \times \mathbf{B} \right) \cdot \nabla_v f_e = \mathcal{C}_{ee} \left( f_e \right) + \mathcal{C}_{ei} \left( f_e, f_i \right) + \mathcal{C}_{e\alpha} \left( f_e, f_\alpha \right)$$
Electron-ion (thermal) collisions
$$T_i \approx T_e$$

- Impose a fast ion flux
- Assume  $\tau_{ei} \ll \tau_{\alpha e}$  and  $v_{\alpha} \tau_{ei} \ll L_H$  steady-state, local behaviour of electrons
- Seek perturbative solutions to VFP equation (Chapman-Enskog Theory)

*Electron gyro-frequency* 

 $\mathbf{\omega} = -\mathbf{e} \mathbf{B}$ 

 $m_e$ 

 $m_e$ 

 $\mathbf{a} = -\mathbf{E}$ 

Imperial College

London

$$vf_0\left[\frac{\nabla n_e}{n_e} + \frac{2}{v_{Te}^2}\mathbf{a} + \frac{\nabla T_e}{T_e}\left(\frac{v^2}{v_{Te}^2} - \frac{3}{2}\right)\right] + \mathbf{C}_{e\alpha 1}^{01} = \boldsymbol{\omega} \times \mathbf{f_1} + \mathbf{C}_{ee1} + \mathbf{C}_{ei1} + \mathbf{C}_{e\alpha 1}^{10}$$

Driving terms

*Electron response terms* 

# **Electron** $f_1$ – unmagnetized case



 $T_e = 2 \ keV$  $E_{\alpha} = 3.45 \ MeV$  $\frac{v_{\alpha}}{v_{Te}} = 0.48$  $\langle v_{\alpha} \rangle = 4 \times 10^6 \ ms^{-1}$ 

**Imperial College** 

London

- $Max f_I$  occurs at velocities close to electron thermal velocity
- Magnitude of  $f_I$  is proportional to  $n_{\alpha}$
- $f_1$  is directed parallel to  $\alpha$  flux

These effects are independent of the  $\alpha$  heating of electrons and ions



- $\perp$  is parallel to  $\alpha$  flux
- $\wedge$  is orthogonal to  $\alpha$  flux and **B** field

- $\chi$  ,  $\omega au_{ei}$  electron Hall parameter
- Small  $\omega \tau_{ei}$  collisions dominate
- Large  $\omega \tau_{ei}$  **B** field dominates

Parameterization of *B* field





### **Collisionally-induced current**



#### **Collisionally-induced current**





### **Collisionally-induced current**



This is similar current densities achieved on Z

### **The Induction Equation**

Imperial College CIFS

 $\frac{\partial B}{\partial t} \sim 10^{13} - 10^{15} T s^{-1}$ 

•  $j_{e\alpha}$  can be incorporated in fluid models via an induction equation



[14] Braginskii, Rev Plas Phys 1, pp. 205- (1965)[15] Epperlein & Haines, Phys Fluids 29, pp. 1029=1041 (1986)



#### Contents

- 1. Overview of Burning Plasmas
- **2.** The interaction of  $\alpha$  particles with electrons
  - Appelbe et al, *Physics of Plasmas* **26**, 102704 (2019)
- 3. Magnetic field transport in propagating thermonuclear burn
  - Appelbe et al, *Physics of Plasmas* **28**, 032705 (2021)
- 4. Conclusions



$$\frac{\partial n}{\partial \hat{t}} + \frac{\partial}{\partial \hat{x}} \left( n \hat{u} \right) = 0 \qquad \qquad \text{DT fuel continuity eqn}$$

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial \hat{x}} \left( 2nT + \frac{B^2}{2\mu_0} \right) = 0 \qquad \qquad \text{Isobaric condition}$$

$$\frac{\partial B}{\partial \hat{t}} + \frac{\partial}{\partial \hat{x}} \left( \hat{u}B \right) = \frac{\partial}{\partial \hat{x}} \left[ \hat{\alpha} \frac{\partial B}{\partial \hat{x}} + \left( \hat{\beta} \frac{\partial \ln T}{\partial \hat{x}} + \hat{\gamma} \frac{\partial \ln \mathcal{E}_{\alpha}}{\partial \hat{x}} \right) B \right]$$

Induction eqn

DT fuel energy eqn

$$3n\frac{DT}{D\hat{t}} + 2nT\frac{\partial\hat{u}}{\partial\hat{x}} = \frac{\partial}{\partial\hat{x}}\left[\hat{\kappa}\frac{\partial T}{\partial\hat{x}} + \hat{\beta}\frac{B}{\mu_0}\frac{\partial B}{\partial\hat{x}}\right] + \hat{q}_{\alpha} - \hat{P}$$

$$\frac{D\mathcal{E}_{\alpha}}{D\hat{t}} + \frac{5}{3}\mathcal{E}_{\alpha}\frac{\partial\hat{u}}{\partial\hat{x}} = \frac{\partial}{\partial\hat{x}}\left(\hat{\delta}_{\mathcal{E}}\frac{\partial\mathcal{E}_{\alpha}}{\partial\hat{x}}\right) - \hat{q}_{\alpha} + \hat{Q} \qquad \qquad \alpha \text{ energy eqn}$$



 $\frac{\partial n}{\partial \hat{t}} + \frac{\partial}{\partial \hat{x}} \left( n\hat{u} \right) = 0$ 

DT fuel continuity eqn

Thermal pressure

Magnetic pressure



 $\Omega D$ 

ΩΓ

Isobaric condition

$$\frac{\partial B}{\partial \hat{t}} + \frac{\partial}{\partial \hat{x}} \left( \hat{u}B \right) = \frac{\partial}{\partial \hat{x}} \left[ \hat{\alpha} \frac{\partial B}{\partial \hat{x}} + \left( \hat{\beta} \frac{\partial \ln T}{\partial \hat{x}} + \hat{\gamma} \frac{\partial \ln \mathcal{E}_{\alpha}}{\partial \hat{x}} \right) B \right] \qquad \text{Integral}$$

$$3n \frac{DT}{D\hat{t}} + 2nT \frac{\partial \hat{u}}{\partial \hat{x}} = \frac{\partial}{\partial \hat{x}} \left[ \hat{\kappa} \frac{\partial T}{\partial \hat{x}} + \hat{\beta} \frac{B}{\mu_0} \frac{\partial B}{\partial \hat{x}} \right] + \hat{q}_{\alpha} - \hat{P} \qquad D$$

( 01 T

duction eqn

T fuel energy eqn

$$\frac{D\mathcal{E}_{\alpha}}{D\hat{t}} + \frac{5}{3}\mathcal{E}_{\alpha}\frac{\partial\hat{u}}{\partial\hat{x}} = \frac{\partial}{\partial\hat{x}}\left(\hat{\delta}_{\mathcal{E}}\frac{\partial\mathcal{E}_{\alpha}}{\partial\hat{x}}\right) - \hat{q}_{\alpha} + \hat{Q} \qquad \qquad \alpha \text{ energy eqn}$$



 $\frac{\partial n}{\partial \hat{t}} + \frac{\partial}{\partial \hat{x}} \left( n\hat{u} \right) = 0$ DT fuel continuity eqn

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial \hat{x}} \left( 2nT + \frac{B^2}{2\mu_0} \right) = 0 \qquad \qquad \text{Isobaric condition}$$

on

Thermal conductivity

Ettingshausen

 $\alpha$  heating

Brems losses

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\partial B}{\partial \hat{t}} + \frac{\partial}{\partial \hat{x}} \left( \hat{u}B \right) &= \frac{\partial}{\partial \hat{x}} \left[ \hat{\alpha} \frac{\partial B}{\partial \hat{x}} + \left( \hat{\beta} \frac{\partial \ln T}{\partial \hat{x}} + \hat{\gamma} \frac{\partial \ln \mathcal{E}_{\alpha}}{\partial \hat{x}} \right) B \right] & \text{Induction eqn} \\ 3n \frac{DT}{D\hat{t}} + 2nT \frac{\partial \hat{u}}{\partial \hat{x}} &= \frac{\partial}{\partial \hat{x}} \left[ \hat{\kappa} \frac{\partial T}{\partial \hat{x}} + \left[ \hat{\beta} \frac{B}{\mu_0} \frac{\partial B}{\partial \hat{x}} \right] + \left[ \hat{q}_{\alpha} + \hat{P} \right] & \text{DT fuel energy eqn} \\ \frac{D\mathcal{E}_{\alpha}}{D\hat{t}} + \frac{5}{3} \mathcal{E}_{\alpha} \frac{\partial \hat{u}}{\partial \hat{x}} &= \frac{\partial}{\partial \hat{x}} \left( \hat{\delta}_{\mathcal{E}} \frac{\partial \mathcal{E}_{\alpha}}{\partial \hat{x}} \right) - \hat{q}_{\alpha} + \hat{Q} & \alpha \text{ energy eqn} \end{aligned}$$



$$rac{\partial n}{\partial \hat{t}} + rac{\partial}{\partial \hat{x}} \left( n \hat{u} 
ight) = 0$$
 DT fuel continuity eqn

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial \hat{x}} \left( 2nT + \frac{B^2}{2\mu_0} \right) = 0 \qquad \qquad \text{Isobaric condition}$$

$$\frac{\partial B}{\partial \hat{t}} + \frac{\partial}{\partial \hat{x}} \left( \hat{u}B \right) = \frac{\partial}{\partial \hat{x}} \left[ \hat{\alpha} \frac{\partial B}{\partial \hat{x}} + \left( \hat{\beta} \frac{\partial \ln T}{\partial \hat{x}} + \hat{\gamma} \frac{\partial \ln \mathcal{E}_{\alpha}}{\partial \hat{x}} \right) B \right] \qquad \text{Induction eqn}$$

$$3n \frac{DT}{D\hat{t}} + 2nT \frac{\partial \hat{u}}{\partial \hat{x}} = \frac{\partial}{\partial \hat{x}} \left[ \hat{\kappa} \frac{\partial T}{\partial \hat{x}} + \hat{\beta} \frac{B}{\mu_0} \frac{\partial B}{\partial \hat{x}} \right] + \hat{q}_{\alpha} - \hat{P} \qquad \text{DT fuel energy}$$

 $\frac{D\mathcal{E}_{\alpha}}{D\hat{t}} + \frac{5}{3}\mathcal{E}_{\alpha}\frac{\partial\hat{u}}{\partial\hat{x}} = \frac{\partial}{\partial\hat{x}}\left(\hat{\delta}_{\mathcal{E}}\frac{\partial\mathcal{E}_{\alpha}}{\partial\hat{x}}\right) - \hat{q}_{\alpha} + \hat{Q}$ 

energy eqn

 $\alpha$  energy eqn

[16] Liberman & Velikovich, JPP **31**, 369-380 (1984)

Magnetized  $\alpha$  energy diffusion



 $\alpha$  energy prod rate



• 1D planar geometry

Cold

Fuel

- Semi-infinite hot & cold fuel ٠
- Isobaric, deflagration only ۲
- Dimensionless time & space: •
  - $\circ \ \ au_{lpha H}$  slowing time for lphain hot fuel
  - $\circ$   $L_T$  mean  $\alpha$  stopping distance (unmagnetized)

 $\partial D$ 

$$\frac{\partial n}{\partial \hat{t}} + \frac{\partial}{\partial \hat{x}} \left( n\hat{u} \right) = 0$$

 $\mathcal{A} \vdash \mathcal{A} \mathcal{D}$ 

DT fuel continuity eqn

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial \hat{x}}\left(2nT+\frac{B^2}{2\mu_0}
ight)=0$$
 Isobaric condition

 $\left( \begin{array}{c} \partial \ln T \\ \partial \ln S \end{array} \right)$ 

$$\frac{\partial B}{\partial \hat{t}} + \frac{\partial}{\partial \hat{x}} \left( \hat{u}B \right) = \frac{\partial}{\partial \hat{x}} \left[ \hat{\alpha} \frac{\partial B}{\partial \hat{x}} + \left( \hat{\beta} \frac{\partial \ln T}{\partial \hat{x}} + \hat{\gamma} \frac{\partial \ln \mathcal{E}_{\alpha}}{\partial \hat{x}} \right) B \right] \qquad \text{Induction eqn}$$
Hot
Fuel
$$3n \frac{DT}{D\hat{t}} + 2nT \frac{\partial \hat{u}}{\partial \hat{x}} = \frac{\partial}{\partial \hat{x}} \left[ \hat{\kappa} \frac{\partial T}{\partial \hat{x}} + \hat{\beta} \frac{B}{\mu_0} \frac{\partial B}{\partial \hat{x}} \right] + \hat{q}_{\alpha} - \hat{P} \qquad \text{DT fuel energy eqn}$$

$$\frac{D\mathcal{E}_{\alpha}}{D\hat{t}} + \frac{5}{3} \mathcal{E}_{\alpha} \frac{\partial \hat{u}}{\partial \hat{x}} = \frac{\partial}{\partial \hat{x}} \left( \hat{\delta}_{\mathcal{E}} \frac{\partial \mathcal{E}_{\alpha}}{\partial \hat{x}} \right) - \hat{q}_{\alpha} + \hat{Q} \qquad \alpha \text{ energy eqn}$$



### **Induction Equation**





### **Induction Equation**





#### **Induction Equation**

$$\frac{\partial B}{\partial \hat{t}} + \frac{\partial}{\partial \hat{x}} \left( \hat{u}B \right) = \frac{\partial}{\partial \hat{x}} \left[ \hat{\alpha} \frac{\partial B}{\partial \hat{x}} + \left( \hat{\beta} \frac{\partial \ln T}{\partial \hat{x}} + \hat{\gamma} \frac{\partial \ln \mathcal{E}_{\alpha}}{\partial \hat{x}} \right) B \right]$$





 $10^{3}$ 

2.8

#### **B** fields in ICF









#### Self-generated **B** fields $\omega \tau > \sim 1$

[6] Walsh et al, PRL 118, 155001 (2017)

#### Simple Model for Local B field





Burn time = 100 ps

#### Evolution of B field

















$$\frac{\partial B}{\partial \hat{t}} + \frac{\partial}{\partial \hat{x}} \left( \hat{u}B \right) = \frac{\partial}{\partial \hat{x}} \left[ \hat{\alpha} \frac{\partial B}{\partial \hat{x}} + \left( \hat{\beta} \frac{\partial \ln T}{\partial \hat{x}} + \hat{\gamma} \frac{\partial \ln \mathcal{E}_{\alpha}}{\partial \hat{x}} \right) B \right]$$





$$\frac{\partial B}{\partial \hat{t}} + \frac{\partial}{\partial \hat{x}} \left( \hat{u}B \right) = \frac{\partial}{\partial \hat{x}} \left[ \hat{\alpha} \frac{\partial B}{\partial \hat{x}} + \left( \hat{\beta} \frac{\partial \ln T}{\partial \hat{x}} + \hat{\gamma} \frac{\partial \ln \mathcal{E}_{\alpha}}{\partial \hat{x}} \right) B \right]$$

![](_page_42_Picture_1.jpeg)

![](_page_42_Figure_2.jpeg)

#### **Evolution of Hall parameter**

![](_page_43_Picture_1.jpeg)

![](_page_43_Figure_2.jpeg)

#### **Evolution of Hall parameter**

10<sup>-5</sup>

x (m)

25<sub>F</sub>

20

Hall parameter

5

0 10<sup>-6</sup>

**•**0

ωτ

![](_page_44_Picture_1.jpeg)

10<sup>-4</sup>

10<sup>-3</sup>

7S

#### **Evolution of Hall parameter**

![](_page_45_Picture_1.jpeg)

#### **Thermal Conductivity**

![](_page_46_Picture_1.jpeg)

![](_page_46_Figure_2.jpeg)

![](_page_47_Picture_1.jpeg)

![](_page_47_Figure_2.jpeg)

![](_page_48_Picture_1.jpeg)

![](_page_48_Figure_2.jpeg)

![](_page_49_Picture_1.jpeg)

 $\sigma_{\chi} = \frac{D \ln \chi_e}{D \hat{t}} = \frac{1}{B} \frac{DB}{D \hat{t}} + \frac{g}{T} \frac{DT}{D \hat{t}}$ 

![](_page_49_Figure_3.jpeg)

50

![](_page_50_Picture_1.jpeg)

![](_page_50_Figure_2.jpeg)

51

![](_page_51_Picture_1.jpeg)

![](_page_51_Figure_2.jpeg)

![](_page_52_Figure_0.jpeg)

![](_page_53_Figure_0.jpeg)

![](_page_54_Figure_0.jpeg)

![](_page_55_Figure_0.jpeg)

![](_page_56_Figure_0.jpeg)

Effect of B field on burn propagation rate Imperial College

![](_page_57_Figure_1.jpeg)

![](_page_58_Picture_0.jpeg)

#### Contents

- 1. Overview of Burning Plasmas
- **2.** The interaction of  $\alpha$  particles with electrons
  - Appelbe et al, *Physics of Plasmas* **26**, 102704 (2019)
- 3. Magnetic field transport in propagating thermonuclear burn
  - Appelbe et al, *Physics of Plasmas* **28**, 032705 (2021)

#### 4. Conclusions

#### Conclusions

![](_page_59_Picture_1.jpeg)

- $\alpha$  flux generates a collisionally-induced current in burning DT plasma
  - $\bigcirc$  This current can generate and transport B field
  - Can perturbation of electrons have any other effects?
- Multiple processes contribute to **B** field transport at a propagating burn front
  - What transport effects occur in 2D/3D?
  - How does **B** field transport interact with instabilities?
- Magnetization grows rapidly at burn front, reducing energy transport

• How significant is this effect in spherical/cylindrical geometry?

![](_page_59_Figure_10.jpeg)